



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday
1st February 2011, at 09.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Michael Cameron St. John Birt Esquire.**

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,
Lieutenant-General Andrew Peter Ridgway, C.B., C.B.E.,
was present.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen – absent on States business (arrived in the Chamber at 12.30 p.m.)
Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson – en défaut
Connétable Kenneth Priaulx Vibert of St. Ouen – en défaut
Connétable Alan Simon Crowcroft of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.48 a.m.)
Connétable John Le Sueur Gallichan of Trinity – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 9.35 a.m.)
Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.36 a.m.)
Deputy Anne Teresa Dupré of St. Clement – excused attendance
Deputy Deborah Jane De Sousa of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.48 a.m.)

Prayers read by the Dean Substitute

Changes to the Consolidated Order Paper

The Bailiff advised Members that, in accordance with the States decision taken on 19th January 2011 to adopt the proposition of the Privileges and Procedures Committee entitled ‘Amendment (No. 14) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey’ (P.169/2010), changes had been made to the Consolidated Order Paper to obviate the need for a separate Supplementary Order Paper to be printed.

Subordinate enactments tabled

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Sand Racing (Jersey) Order 2011. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.7/2011.
Road Racing (Hill Climbs and Sprint) (Jersey) Order 2011. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.8/2011.
Road Traffic (Public Parking Places – Charges) (Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2011. <i>Minister for Transport and Technical Services.</i>	R&O.9/2011.
Community Provisions (Bovine Embryos) (Fees) (Jersey) Order 2011. <i>Minister for Planning and Environment.</i>	R&O.10/2011.

Documents presented or laid

Standing Orders: minimum lodging periods – revision (P.194/2010) – comments. Presented: 31st January 2011. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	P.194/2010. Com.
Standing Orders: minimum lodging periods – revision (P.194/2010) – amendment (P.194/2010 Amd.) – comments. Presented: 31st January 2011. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	P.194/2010. Amd.Com.
Insolvency: temporary scheme for compensatory payment in lieu of statutory period of notice on termination of employment – revised Report. Presented: 27th January 2011. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	R.5/2011.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegated functions – Economic Development January 2011. Presented: 31st January 2011. <i>Minister for Economic Development.</i>	R.6/2011.
Strategic Plan: progress against Priorities as at 31st December 2010. Presented: 1st February 2011. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	R.7/2011.
Historical Child Abuse: Committee of Inquiry. Presented: 1st February 2011. <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	R.8/2011.
Political Education (S.R.14/2010): response of the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture. Presented: 1st February 2011. <i>Minister for Education, Sport and Culture.</i>	S.R.14/2010. Res.
Jersey Development Company. Presented: 28th January 2011. <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.1/2011.
Notification of lodged propositions	
North of Town Masterplan (Revised) (P.190/2010): third amendment. Lodged: 25th January 2011. <i>Connétable of St. Helier.</i>	P.190/2010. Amd.(3)
Composition of the States: implementation of remaining Clothier reforms – referendum (P.3/2011) – amendment. Lodged: 26th January 2011. <i>Senator F. du H. Le Gresley.</i>	P.3/2011. Amd.
Ratification of a Double Taxation Agreement between the States of Jersey and the Government of Estonia. Lodged: 24th January 2011. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.7/2011.

- Ratification of the Agreement for the Exchange of Information relating to Tax Matters between the Government of Jersey and the Government of Canada. P.8/2011.
Lodged: 24th January 2011.
Chief Minister.
- Geneva Conventions: Additional Protocol III – extension to Jersey. P.9/2011.
Lodged: 24th January 2011.
Chief Minister.
- Draft Banking Business (Amendment No. 7) (Jersey) Law 201-. P.10/2011.
Lodged: 25th January 2011.
Minister for Economic Development.
- Income Support Medical Appeal Tribunal: appointment of members. P.11/2011.
Lodged: 27th January 2011.
Minister for Social Security.
- Social Security Tribunal: appointment of members. P.12/2011.
Lodged: 27th January 2011.
Minister for Social Security.
- Jersey Employment Tribunal: appointment of members. P.13/2011.
Lodged: 27th January 2011.
Minister for Social Security.
- Draft Public Elections (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Law 201-. P.14/2010.
Lodged: 27th January 2011.
Privileges and Procedures Committee.
- Electoral Commission: establishment. P.15/2011.
Lodged: 31st January 2011.
Deputy of St. Mary.
- Minister for Treasury and Resources: request to Chief Minister to lodge proposition for dismissal – petition. P.16/2011.
Lodged: 1st February 2011.
Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.
- Manual Workers' Joint Council: Employers' Side membership. P.17/2011.
Lodged: 1st February 2011.
States Employment Board.
- Standing Orders: oral questions with notice. P.18/2011.
Lodged: 1st February 2011.
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.

Withdrawal of lodged propositions

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

Freedom of Information: implementation plan. P.145/2010.
Lodged: 13th October 2010.
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier of St. Saviour.

Ministerial offices: reduction. P.171/2010.
Lodged: 12th November 2010.
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.

Privileges and Procedures Committee – appointment of a member

In accordance with Standing Order 122, the Connétable of St. Mary, Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, nominated Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier as a member of the Privileges and Procedures Committee who was not a Minister or Assistant Minister.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier had been duly elected as a member of the Privileges and Procedures Committee.

Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel – appointment of member

In accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 125(1) Deputy Tracey Anne Vallois of St. Saviour, Vice-Chairman of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, nominated Deputy Deborah Jane De Sousa of St. Helier as a member of the Panel.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that Deputy Deborah Jane De Sousa of St. Helier had been duly elected as a member of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.

Minister for Treasury and Resources – request to the Chief Minister

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier presented a petition to the States requesting the Chief Minister to lodge a proposition to dismiss the Minister for Treasury and Resources.

Written Questions

(see Official Report/Hansard)

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy A.K.F. Green of St. Helier regarding legislation for cycle helmets.

The Minister for Planning and Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy A.K.F. Green of St. Helier regarding legislation for the provision of disabled toilets.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator A. Breckon regarding business arrangements between the JEC and Newtel.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator A. Breckon regarding a complaint to Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the signature on Treasury cheques.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the new dairy at Trinity.

The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier regarding work permits.

The Minister for Planning and Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator J.L. Perchard regarding the Odeon Cinema building.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator J.L. Perchard regarding the incineration of metal cans and tins.

The Minister for Social Security tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier regarding allegations of abuse of the Income Support system.

The Minister for Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier regarding the protection of tenants in Housing Trust properties.

The Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier regarding the election of Senators.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier regarding increases in taxation rates.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier regarding tax rates for wealthy residents.

The Minister for Planning and Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier regarding the Energy Policy Green Paper.

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier regarding composting costs.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier regarding the compilation of accident statistics.

The Minister for Social Security tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier regarding the overall cost of the Income Support system.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding insurance assistance for families travelling to the UK.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Martin regarding parking at the Airport.

The Minister for Home Affairs tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Martin regarding suspended police officers.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by Senator F. du H. Le Gresley regarding actual expenditure against Business Plan Key Objectives.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the granting of a postal licence to TNT.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding tax revenues.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding charges on zero-rate companies.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the creation of sustainable jobs.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding cancelled operations.

The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier regarding suspended staff.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier regarding staff at Jersey Airport.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the collective investment of funds.

The Minister for Economic Development tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the use of insecticides.

The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the competence of civil servants.

The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. Mary regarding the use of consultants.

Oral Questions

(see Official Report/Hansard)

The Deputy of St. Mary asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding reputational damage to Jersey's tax regime.

Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the new European Union Savings Tax Directive.

The Connétable of Grouville asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the cost of the new post in Brussels.

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding the Zero/Ten tax policy.

The Deputy of St. John asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the disposal of a container full of fireworks.

Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development regarding the loss of local trade to non-resident labour.

Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding anti-social misuse of cars and motorbikes at the Albert Quay.

The Deputy of St. Martin asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding Jersey Human Rights training.

Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding cancer statistics.

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisser of St. Saviour asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the appointments process for the Assistant Minister responsible for External Relations.

Deputy S. Pitman of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding contingency plans should there be a 'double-dip' recession in the UK.

Deputy A.K.F. Green of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Transport and Technical Services regarding the removal of the charity scrap metal skip at the Bellozanne recycling site.

Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Housing regarding plans to build 4 new homes on green areas in Les Quennevais Park and Le Clos des Sables.

The Deputy of St. John asked a question of the Vice-Chairman of the Comité des Connétable regarding the new standardised rates form for all the Island Parishes.

Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding the scale of the unemployment problem in Jersey for those aged under 25.

Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the proposed territorial business tax.

The Deputy of St. Martin asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the withdrawal of part (d) of the Terms of Reference for the Napier Report.

Deputy T.M. Pitman of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Transport and Technical Services regarding charges for short-term parking in Patriotic Street Car Park for out-patients at the Hospital.

Oral Questions without notice
(see *Official Report/Hansard*)

The Minister for Treasury and Resources answered questions without notice from members.

The Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.

Statements on a matter of official responsibility
(see *Official Report/Hansard*)

The Chief Minister made a statement concerning the commissioning of a Committee of Inquiry into the historical child abuse investigations.

Shadow Boards and Ministerial Boards: approval by the States P.170/2010

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier concerning the approval of Shadow and Ministerial Boards by the States and, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Economic Development, agreed that in paragraph (a) for the words “for approval the proposal announced by the Minister on 3rd November 2010 for the formation of a Shadow Board to oversee all aspects of Harbours and Airport” there should be substituted the words “for approval the Terms of Reference for the Shadow Board appointed by the Minister for Economic Development, as set out in points 1–7 in the report of the Minister dated 19th January 2011, to oversee all aspects of Harbours and Airport;”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 31

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

CONTRE: 8

Senator A. Breckon
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

ABSTAIN: 3

Connétable of St. John
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

THE STATES, adopting paragraphs (a) and (b) of a proposition of Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier, as amended, agreed to request the Minister for Economic Development to bring to the States for approval the Terms of Reference for the Shadow Board appointed by the Minister for Economic Development, as set out in points 1–7 in the report of the Minister dated 19th January 2011, to oversee all aspects of Harbours and Airport and that no such similar bodies should be established by Ministers until the proposal to establish the body had been agreed by the States in all cases where payment of remuneration was to be made to members of the body concerned and where members were to be permitted access to information and financially sensitive data held by the Department and where the body was to be established with a view to shaping government policy or informing the delivery of change, that Ministers should, before finalising any proposals to establish bodies of this nature, consult the Public Accounts Committee, the Privileges and Procedures Committee and the relevant Scrutiny Panel to ensure appropriate oversight of the proposals.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 36

Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 11

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

ABSTAIN: 1

Connétable of St. Mary

THE STATES rejected paragraph (c) of a proposition of Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier, as amended, to agree that any proposals by Ministers to establish Ministerial Boards of elected members to advise them should be subject to prior States approval of the –

- (i) proposed membership of the Board;
- (ii) terms of reference of the Board;
- (iii) financial and manpower implications;
- (iv) scope of the policies to be considered by the Board.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 21

Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)

CONTRE: 27

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

ABSTAIN: 0**Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions P.174/2010**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Senator Paul Francis Routier entitled ‘Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions’ (P.174/2010) and rejected an amendment of the Deputy of St. John that for the number “7” there should be substituted the number “2”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 19

Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

CONTRE: 28

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

ABSTAIN: 1

Deputy J.B. Fox (H)

THE STATES commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier that after the words “other members” there should be inserted the words “although the names of the members who endorse and countersign the proposition shall not be disclosed or published by the Greffier of the States unless he or she is requested to do so by the proposer” and the proposition renumbered as paragraph (a) and a new paragraph (b) should be inserted as follows –

- “(b) to request the Privileges and Procedures Committee to bring forward, as part of the amendments to Standing Orders to give effect to paragraph (a), a further provision that any member wishing to lodge a proposition that requires endorsement and countersignature under the new provisions shall be permitted to submit it to Greffier of the States prior to obtaining the necessary signatures and, once this is done, the Greffier shall not be permitted to accept a proposition in the same or substantially the same terms from any other member for a period of one week.”.

THE STATES, following discussion, granted leave to Deputy Paul Vincent Francis Le Claire of St. Helier to withdraw his amendment to the proposition of Senator Paul Francis Routier entitled ‘Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions’ (P.174/2010).

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 37

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 3

Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier that the existing proposition of Senator Paul Francis Routier entitled ‘Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions’ (P.174/2010), should be renumbered as paragraph (a) and a new paragraph (b) should be inserted as follows –

- “(b) to request the Privileges and Procedures Committee to bring forward an amendment to Standing Orders to require a proposition for debate lodged by the Chief Minister or another Minister to be endorsed and countersigned by all other 9 members of the Council of Ministers.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 4

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)

CONTRE: 39

Senator P.F. Routier
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
Senator T.J. Le Main
Senator B.E. Shenton
Senator F.E. Cohen
Senator J.L. Perchard
Senator A. Breckon
Senator A.J.H. Maclean
Senator B.I. Le Marquand
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
Connétable of St. Helier
Connétable of Trinity
Connétable of Grouville
Connétable of St. Brelade
Connétable of St. John
Connétable of St. Saviour
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier had decided to withdraw his amendment to the proposition of Senator Paul Francis Routier entitled ‘Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions’ (P.174/2010).

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of Senator Paul Francis Routier entitled ‘Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions’ (P.174/2010) and rejected a proposition of the Deputy of St. John that the meeting should continue until the debate was concluded.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 12

Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator A. Breckon
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)

CONTRE: 31

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

ABSTAIN: 0**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 2nd February 2011, to continue consideration of the proposition of Senator Paul Francis Routier entitled ‘Standing Orders: additional signatories on propositions’ (P.174/2010) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.36 p.m.

A.H. HARRIS

Deputy Greffier of the States